

L8 (By Peter Lohmander 2009-10-23)

Dynamic game theory. General theory, application examples, analytical solutions and numerical solutions via computer programming.

One period game theory and applications:

Lohmander, P., Optimal Taktik 1, Web software for decision optimization in two person zero sum games (with examples described in Swedish), 2002

http://www.lohmander.com/mil/2pzsg/Taktik_PL_1.htm

Lohmander, P., Optimal decentralized tactical decisions of isolated blue units behind red lines, (Abstract book), New Opportunities for Operations Research, EURO/INFORMS (= The Association of European Operational Research Societies / Institute for Operations Research and the Management Sciences), Military Operations Research Cluster, Istanbul, July 06-10, 2003,

<http://www.lohmander.com/mil/EUROInf03.doc>

<http://www.lohmander.com/mil/Tactical7.doc>

<http://www.lohmander.com/mil/NashLP2.doc>

Lohmander, P., Strategiska och taktiska aspekter på armens optimala agerande I mörker, mörkerträning samt mörkermateriel, Umeå 2 Hemvärnsbataljon, 2003-11-15

<http://www.lohmander.com/mil/DarkArm.doc>

Lohmander, P., Hemvärnet vinner på spelteori, Tidskriften Hemvärnet #1, 2004

http://www.hemvarnet.mil.se/hemvarnet/attachments/0401_22-24.pdf/a>

Original full text: <http://www.lohmander.com/mil/ResFStri.html>

Shorter version: <http://www.lohmander.com/mil/OriResFStri.html>

Lohmander, P., Fatta beslut med hjälp av spelteori, Hemvärnet - Nationella Skyddsstyrkorna, 2007-10-26

<http://tidningenhemvarnet.se/>

<http://webnews.textalk.com/se/article.php?id=281997>

<http://www.lohmander.com/mil/OT070823.doc>

Luce, R., H. Raiffa (1957), Games and Decisions, Wiley, New York

von Neumann, J. (1928), Zur Theorie der Gesellschaftsspiele, Mathematische Annalen, No. 100, p 295-320

von Neumann, J., O. Morgenstern (1944), Theory of Games and Economic Behaviour, Princeton University Press, Princeton, NJ

Washburn, A.R. (2003) Two-person zero-sum games, 3 ed., INFORMS, Military applications society, Topics in operations research series

Winston, W. L. (2004), Operations Research, Applications and Algorithms, Chapter 14: Game Theory, 4 ed., Thomson, ISBN: 0-534-42362-0

Dynamic game theory and applications in discrete time:

Isaacs R. (1965) Differential Games – A mathematical theory with applications to warfare and pursuit, control and optimization, Wiley, 1965 (Also Dover, 1999)

Lohmander, P., A Stochastic Differential (Difference) Game Model with an LP Subroutine for Mixed and Pure Strategy Optimization, INFORMS International Meeting 2007, Puerto Rico, Power Point Presentation,

<http://meetings.informs.org/PuertoRico2007/>

http://www.lohmander.com/mil/Mil_OR_2007.htm

<http://www.Lohmander.com/SDG.ppt>

Dynamic game theory and applications in continuous time:

Lohmander, P., Expansion dynamics and noncooperative decisions in stochastic markets: - Theory and pulp industry application, in: Helles, F., Linddal, M. (editors), SCANDINAVIAN FOREST ECONOMICS, Proceedings from the Scandinavian Society of Forest Economics, Denmark, November, 1993, No. 35, 1994

Lohmander, P., The constrained probability orbit of mixed strategy games with marginal adjustment: General theory and timber market application, SYSTEMS ANALYSIS - MODELLING - SIMULATION, Vol. 29, 27-55, 1997

Mohammadi, L.S., Lohmander, P., A game theory approach to the Iranian forest industry raw material market, Scandinavian Forest Economics No. 41, 2006 and (marginally updated) in Mohammadi, L. S., Economically optimal values and decisions in Iranian forest management, Doctoral Thesis No. 2006:91, Faculty of Forest Sciences, SLU, Acta Universitatis Agriculturae Sueciae, 2006

Mohammadi, L.S., Lohmander, P., A game theory approach to the Iranian forest industry raw material market, Caspian Journal of Environmental Sciences, Vol 6, No1, pp. 59-71, 2008

<http://research.guilan.ac.ir/cjes/.papers/969.pdf>

<http://www.Lohmander.com/MoLoAGTA.pdf>

The Nash equilibrium is the optimal mixed strategy solution to a two person zero sum game based on linear programming

By Peter Lohmander Version 2003-06-26

(This document is a part of a presentation by Peter Lohmander at EURO/Informs, Military Operations Research III, Istanbul, 2003.)

<http://www.lohmander.com/mil/EUROInf03.doc>

$$\begin{bmatrix} \alpha_{11} & \alpha_{12} & \cdot & \alpha_{1n} \\ \alpha_{21} & \alpha_{22} & \cdot & \alpha_{2n} \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\ \alpha_{m1} & \alpha_{m2} & \cdot & \alpha_{mn} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} x_1 y_1 & \cdot & x_1 y_n \\ \cdot & \cdot & \cdot \\ x_m y_1 & \cdot & x_m y_n \end{bmatrix}$$

The linear programming solution
LP of A:

$$\max E$$

s.t.

$$E \leq \alpha_{11}x_1 + \dots + \alpha_{m1}x_m \quad (\text{against } \beta_1)$$

$$E \leq \alpha_{12}x_1 + \dots + \alpha_{m2}x_m \quad (\text{against } \beta_2)$$

.

$$E \leq \alpha_{1n}x_1 + \dots + \alpha_{mn}x_m \quad (\text{against } \beta_n)$$

$$1 = x_1 + \dots + x_m$$

Assumptions:

$$0 < x_i < 1 \quad \forall i$$

$$0 < y_j < 1 \quad \forall j$$

$$\frac{\partial L}{\partial \lambda_j} \lambda_j = 0$$

These equations determine E and $x_i \quad \forall i$

$$E - \alpha_{11}x_1 - \dots - \alpha_{m1}x_m = 0$$

$$E - \alpha_{12}x_1 - \dots - \alpha_{m2}x_m = 0$$

.

$$E - \alpha_{1n}x_1 - \dots - \alpha_{mn}x_m = 0$$

$$x_1 + \dots + x_m = 1$$

LP of B:

$$\min E$$

s.t.

$$E \geq \alpha_{11}y_1 + \dots + \alpha_{1n}y_n \quad (\text{against } \alpha_1)$$

$$E \geq \alpha_{21}y_1 + \dots + \alpha_{2n}y_n \quad (\text{against } \alpha_2)$$

.

$$E \geq \alpha_{m1}y_1 + \dots + \alpha_{mn}y_n \quad (\text{against } \alpha_m)$$

$$1 = y_1 + \dots + y_n$$

These equations determine E and $y_j \quad \forall j$

$$E - \alpha_{11}y_1 - \dots - \alpha_{1n}y_n = 0$$

$$E - \alpha_{21}y_1 - \dots - \alpha_{2n}y_n = 0$$

.

$$E - \alpha_{m1}y_1 - \dots - \alpha_{mn}y_n = 0$$

$$y_1 + \dots + y_n = 1$$

The Nash mixed strategy equilibrium solution:

$$\pi = \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} \alpha_{ij} x_i y_j + \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} \alpha_{mj} x_m y_j + \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} \alpha_{in} x_i y_n + \alpha_{mn} x_m y_n$$

where

$$x_m = 1 - \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} x_i$$

$$y_n = 1 - \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} y_j$$

This can be rewritten as:

$$\begin{aligned} \pi = & \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} \alpha_{ij} x_i y_j + \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} \alpha_{mj} \left(1 - \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} x_i \right) y_j \\ & + \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} \alpha_{in} x_i \left(1 - \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} y_j \right) + \alpha_{mn} \left(1 - \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} x_i \right) \left(1 - \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} y_j \right) \end{aligned}$$

Nash conditions of A:

$$\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial x_i | (i \neq m)} = \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} \alpha_{ij} y_j - \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} \alpha_{mj} y_j + \alpha_{in} \left(1 - \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} y_j \right) - \alpha_{mn} \left(1 - \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} y_j \right)$$

$$\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial x_i | (i \neq m)} = \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} \alpha_{ij} y_j - \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} \alpha_{mj} y_j + \alpha_{in} y_n - \alpha_{mn} y_n$$

$$\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial x_i | (i \neq m)} = \sum_{j=1}^n \alpha_{ij} y_j - \sum_{j=1}^n \alpha_{mj} y_j$$

$$\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial x_i | (i \neq m)} = \sum_{j=1}^n \alpha_{ij} y_j - E$$

In Nash equilibrium:

$$\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial x_i | (i \neq m)} = \sum_{j=1}^n \alpha_{ij} y_j - E = 0$$

(This is also the result from the LP solution.)

Nash conditions of B:

$$\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial y_j |(j \neq n)} = \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} \alpha_{ij} x_i + \alpha_{mj} \left(1 - \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} x_i \right) - \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} \alpha_{in} x_i - \alpha_{mn} \left(1 - \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} x_i \right)$$

$$\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial y_j |(j \neq n)} = \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} \alpha_{ij} x_i + \alpha_{mj} x_m - \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} \alpha_{in} x_i - \alpha_{mn} x_m$$

$$\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial y_j |(j \neq n)} = \sum_{i=1}^m \alpha_{ij} x_i - \sum_{i=1}^m \alpha_{in} x_i$$

$$\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial y_j |(j \neq n)} = \sum_{i=1}^m \alpha_{ij} x_i - E$$

In Nash equilibrium:

$$\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial y_j |(j \neq n)} = \sum_{i=1}^m \alpha_{ij} x_i - E = 0$$

(This is also the result from the LP solution.)

Observations:

The Nash equilibrium and the LP solution are the same.

This is remarkable since the ideas and principles are quite different:

The Nash solution is derived from the condition that no player would benefit from selecting other probabilities (different from the Nash solution).

The LP solution is derived from the condition that no player can get a worse outcome irrespective of what the opponent does.

Optimal response if the opponent does not play according to Nash (or LP):

A does not benefit from changing the probabilities (controlled by A) in case B plays according to the Nash solution.

In case B selects probabilities different from the Nash solution, A benefits from deviation from the Nash solution.

Case 1. $\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial x_i} > 0$ Then A should increase x_i .

Case 2. $\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial x_i} < 0$ Then A should decrease x_i .

Of course, B benefits from moving from the Nash (or LP) solution if A does not play according to the Nash (or LP) solution.

Case 3. $\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial y_j} > 0$ Then B should decrease y_j .

Case 4. $\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial y_j} < 0$ Then B should increase y_j .

```

! DG_091020_1016;
! Peter Lohmander;

model:

sets:
row/1..2/:X, Xopt;
col/1..2/:Y, Yopt;
rowcol(row,col):a;
player/1..2/:V;
endsets

data:
a = 1 0
    0 1
;
enddata

@FREE(V1);
@FREE(V2);
@FREE(V(1));
@FREE(V(2));
@FREE(DEV);

! ****;
submodel Decl:
[Declobj] max = V1;
@for(col(j): V1 <= @SUM(row(i): a(i,j)*X(i)));
@SUM(row(i): X(i)) <= 1;

endsubmodel
! ****;
submodel Dec2:
[Dec2obj] min = V2;
@for(row(i): V2 >= @SUM(col(j):a(i,j)*Y(j)));
@SUM(col(j): Y(j)) >= 1;

endsubmodel
! ****;

CALC:
@SET('DEFAULT');
@SET('TERSEO', 2);

Nstrat1 = 2;
Nstrat2 = 2;

@SOLVE(Decl);
V(1) = V1;
@for(row(i):Xopt(i) = X(i));

@SOLVE(Dec2);
V(2) = V2;
@for(col(j):Yopt(j) = Y(j));

Value = V(1);
DEV = V(1) - V(2);

@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));

```

```

@IFC( @SQR(DEV) #GT# .001: @WRITE(' *** OPTIMIZATION ERROR *** '));
@WRITE('Value = ', @FORMAT(Value, '7.5G'));
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));
@WRITE('Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:',@NEWLINE(1) );
@FOR(row(i)|i #LE# Nstrat1:
@WRITE( @Format(Xopt(i), '7.5G'), 5*' ');
);
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));

@WRITE('Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:',@NEWLINE(1) );
@FOR(col(j)|j #LE# Nstrat2:
@WRITE( @Format(Yopt(j), '7.5G'), 5*' ');
);
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));

ENDCALC

end

Value =      0.5
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
  0.5          0.5
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
  0.5          0.5

```

```

! DG_091020_0957;
! Peter Lohmander;

model:

sets:
row/1..3/:X, Xopt;
col/1..4/:Y, Yopt;
rowcol(row,col):a;
player/1..2/:V;
endsets

data:
a = .3 .2 .1 0
    .1 .5 .5 .1
    0 .1 .2 .2
;
enddata

@FREE(V1);
@FREE(V2);
@FREE(V(1));
@FREE(V(2));
@FREE(DEV);

! ****
submodel Dec1:
[Dec1obj] max = V1;
@for(col(j): V1 <= @SUM(row(i): a(i,j)*X(i)));
@SUM(row(i): X(i)) <= 1;

endsubmodel
! ****
submodel Dec2:
[Dec2obj] min = V2;
@for(row(i): V2 >= @SUM(col(j):a(i,j)*Y(j)));
@SUM(col(j): Y(j)) >= 1;

endsubmodel
! ****

CALC:
@SET('DEFAULT');
@SET('TERSEO', 2);

Nstrat1 = 3;
Nstrat2 = 4;

@SOLVE(Dec1);
V(1) = V1;
@for(row(i):Xopt(i) = X(i));

@SOLVE(Dec2);
V(2) = V2;
@for(col(j):Yopt(j) = Y(j));

Value = V(1);
DEV = V(1) - V(2);

```

```

@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));
@ifc( @sqr(dev) #gt# .001: @write(' *** OPTIMIZATION ERROR *** '));
@write('Value = ', @format(value, '7.5G'));
@write(@newline(1));
@write('Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:',@newline(1) );
@for(row(i)|i #le# nstrat1:
@write( @format(xopt(i), '7.5G'), 5*' ');
);
@write(@newline(1));

@write('Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:',@newline(1) );
@for(col(j)|j #le# nstrat2:
@write( @format(yopt(j), '7.5G'), 5*' ');
);
@write(@newline(1));
@write(@newline(1));

endc

end

value =      0.12
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
    0.4          0          0.6
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
    0.4          0          0       0.6

```

```

! DG_091020_1318;
! Peter Lohmander;

model:

sets:
row/1..10/:X, Xopt;
col/1..10/:Y, Yopt;
rowcol(row,col):a;
player/1..2/:V;
endsets

@FREE(V1);
@FREE(V2);
@FREE(V(1));
@FREE(V(2));
@FREE(DEV);

! ****;
submodel Decl:
[Declobj] max = V1;
@for(col(j)|j#LE#Nstrat2: V1 <= @SUM(row(i)|i#LE#Nstrat1: a(i,j)*X(i)));
@SUM(row(i)|i#LE#Nstrat1: X(i)) <= 1;

endsubmodel
! ****;
submodel Dec2:
[Dec2obj] min = V2;
@for(row(i)|i#LE#Nstrat1: V2 >= @SUM(col(j)|j#LE#Nstrat2: a(i,j)*Y(j));
@SUM(col(j)|j#LE#Nstrat2: Y(j)) >= 1;

endsubmodel
! ****;

CALC:
@SET('DEFAULT');
@SET('TERSEO', 2);

t = 0;
@WHILE( t#LE#6:
t = t + 1;

Nstrat1 = t + 1;
Nstrat2 = t + 1;
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));
@WRITE('***** NEW GAME *****',@NEWLINE(1));
@WRITE('Nstrat1 = ', @FORMAT(Nstrat1, '3.0G'), ' Nstrat2 = ',
@FORMAT(Nstrat2, '3.5G') );

@if(rowcol(i,j)|i#LT#j #OR# i#GT#j :a(i,j) = 0);
@if(rowcol(i,j)|i#EQ#j: a(i,j) = 1);

@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));
@WRITE('Game matrix = ', @NEWLINE(1));
@WRITE(Nstrat2*'-----',@NEWLINE(1));
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));

```

```

@for(row(i)| i#LE#Nstrat1:
  @for(col(j)| j#LE#Nstrat2:
    @WRITE( @Format(a(i,j), '7.5G'), 5*' ');
  );
  @WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));
);
@WRITE(Nstrat2*'-----',@NEWLINE(1));

@SOLVE(Dec1);
V(1) = V1;
@for(row(i):Xopt(i) = X(i));

@SOLVE(Dec2);
V(2) = V2;
@for(col(j):Yopt(j) = Y(j));

Value = V(1);
DEV = V(1) - V(2);

@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));
@ifc( @SQR(DEV) #gt# .001: @WRITE(' *** OPTIMIZATION ERROR *** '));
@WRITE('Value of the game = ', @FORMAT(Value, '7.5G'));
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));
@WRITE('Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:',@NEWLINE(1));
@for(row(i)|i #le# Nstrat1:
@WRITE( @Format(Xopt(i), '7.5G'), 5*' ');
);
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));

@WRITE('Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:',@NEWLINE(1));
@for(col(j)|j #le# Nstrat2:
@WRITE( @Format(Yopt(j), '7.5G'), 5*' ');
);
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));

);

ENDCALC

end

***** NEW GAME *****
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 2
Game matrix =
-----
1 0
0 1
-----
Value of the game = 0.5
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0.5 0.5
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0.5 0.5

```

```
***** NEW GAME *****
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 3
Game matrix =
-----
```

1	0	0
0	1	0
0	0	1

```
Value of the game = 0.33333
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0.33333 0.33333 0.33333
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0.33333 0.33333 0.33333
```

```
***** NEW GAME *****
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 4
Game matrix =
-----
```

1	0	0	0
0	1	0	0
0	0	1	0
0	0	0	1

```
Value of the game = 0.25
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25
```

```
***** NEW GAME *****
Nstrat1 = 5 Nstrat2 = 5
Game matrix =
-----
```

1	0	0	0	0
0	1	0	0	0
0	0	1	0	0
0	0	0	1	0
0	0	0	0	1

```
Value of the game = 0.2
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0.2 0.2 0.2 0.2 0.2
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0.2 0.2 0.2 0.2 0.2
```

```
***** NEW GAME *****
Nstrat1 = 6 Nstrat2 = 6
Game matrix =
```

```
-----
1      0      0      0      0      0
0      1      0      0      0      0
0      0      1      0      0      0
0      0      0      1      0      0
0      0      0      0      1      0
0      0      0      0      0      1
-----
```

```
Value of the game = 0.16667
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0.16667    0.16667    0.16667    0.16667    0.16667    0.16667
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0.16667    0.16667    0.16667    0.16667    0.16667    0.16667
```

.... Cont

```

! TRP_091023;
! Transition program;
! Peter Lohmander 091023;
model:
sets:
res/1..10/:prob;
res2/1..10/:;
g/1..10/:;
c/1..10/:;
ResGC(res,res2,g,c):TransP;
endsets

calc:
@SET('DEFAULT');
@SET('TERSEO', 2);

@for(ResGC: TransP = 0);

@for(res(x):
RESTOT = x-1;
@for(g(i)|i#LE#x:
GS1 = i-1;
@for(c(j):
CA2 = j-1;

!
      @WRITE(@NEWLINE(1), 'Resources = ', RESTOT, ' GS1 = ',
@FORMAT(GS1, '6G'),
!
      ' CA2 = ', @FORMAT(CA2, '6G'), @NEWLINE(1) );

Pdeath = 0;
@ifc(CA2#GE#1: Pdeath = 1 - 1/(1+CA2));

@for(res(n): prob(n) = 0);

@for(res2(n)|n#LE#x :
RESTOTnext = n;
REDUCT = RESTOTnext - RESTOT;
prob(n) = - (@PBN(Pdeath, GS1, - REDUCT) - @PBN(Pdeath, GS1, - (REDUCT-1)));
TransP(x,n,i,j) = prob(n);
);

!
  @for(res(n):
    @WRITE( @Format(prob(n), '7.5G'), 5*' ');
  );
  @WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));

);
);
);

count3 = -1;
@while(count3#LE#3:
count3 = count3+1;
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));

count2 = -1;
@while( count2#LE#8:
count2 = count2 + 1;
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));

```

```

count = -1;
@while( count#LE#8:
    count = count + 1;
    restot = count2;
    res2tot = count;
    GS = 2;
    CA = count3;
    restotcorr = restot+1;
    res2totcorr = res2tot+1;
    GScorr = GS+1;
    CAcorr = CA+1;
    TransPcalc = TransP(restotcorr, res2totcorr, GScorr, CAcorr);
    @IFC(GS#LE#restot: @WRITE('restot = ', restot, ' res2tot = ', res2tot,
        ' GS = ', GS, ' CA = ', CA, ' TransP = ', TransPcalc);
    @WRITE(@NEWLINE(1))
);
);
);
);
);

endcalc
end

restot = 2 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 1
restot = 2 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0

restot = 3 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 1
restot = 3 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0

restot = 4 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 4 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 4 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 4 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 4 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 1
restot = 4 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 4 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 4 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 4 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0
restot = 4 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 0 TransP = 0

```



```

restot = 7 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 7 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 7 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 7 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 7 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 7 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0.25
restot = 7 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0.5
restot = 7 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0.25
restot = 7 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 7 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0

```

```

restot = 8 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0.25
restot = 8 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0.5
restot = 8 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0.25
restot = 8 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0

```

```

restot = 9 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0.25
restot = 9 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0.5
restot = 9 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 1 TransP = 0.25

```

```

restot = 2 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0.4444444444444445
restot = 2 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0.4444444444444444
restot = 2 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0.1111111111111111
restot = 2 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0

```

```

restot = 3 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0.4444444444444445
restot = 3 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0.4444444444444444
restot = 3 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0.1111111111111111
restot = 3 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0
restot = 3 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 2 TransP = 0

```



```

restot = 6 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 6 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 6 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 6 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 6 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0.5625
restot = 6 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0.375
restot = 6 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0.06249999999999999
restot = 6 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 6 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 6 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0

restot = 7 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 7 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 7 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 7 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 7 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 7 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0.5625
restot = 7 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0.375
restot = 7 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0.06249999999999999
restot = 7 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 7 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0

restot = 8 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0.5625
restot = 8 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0.375
restot = 8 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0.06249999999999999
restot = 8 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0

restot = 9 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0.5625
restot = 9 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0.375
restot = 9 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 3 TransP = 0.06249999999999999

restot = 2 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0.6400000000000001
restot = 2 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0.32
restot = 2 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0.03999999999999999
restot = 2 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 2 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0

```



```
restot = 8 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 8 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0.6400000000000001
restot = 8 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0.32
restot = 8 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0.03999999999999999
restot = 8 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0

restot = 9 res2tot = 0 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 1 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 2 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 3 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 4 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 5 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 6 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0
restot = 9 res2tot = 7 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0.6400000000000001
restot = 9 res2tot = 8 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0.32
restot = 9 res2tot = 9 GS = 2 CA = 4 TransP = 0.03999999999999999
```

```

! DG_091023;
! Peter Lohmander;
model:
sets:
row/1..4/:X, Xopt;
col/1..4/:Y, Yopt;
rowcol(row,col):a;
player/1..2/:V;
time/1..7/:;
TXY(time,row,col):VALOPT;

res/1..4/:prob;
res2/1..4/:;
g/1..4/:;
c/1..4/:;
ResGC(res,res2,g,c):TransP;

endsets
@FREE(V1);
@FREE(V2);
@FREE(V(1));
@FREE(V(2));
@FREE(DEV);
@for(TXY(t,i,j): @FREE(VALOPT(t,i,j)));

! ****;
submodel Dec1:
[Dec1obj] max = V1;
@for(col(j)|j#LE#Nstrat2: V1 <= @SUM(row(i)|i#LE#Nstrat1: a(i,j)*X(i)));
@SUM(row(i)|i#LE#Nstrat1: X(i)) = 1;

endsubmodel
! ****;
submodel Dec2:
[Dec2obj] min = V2;
@for(row(i)|i#LE#Nstrat1: V2 >= @SUM(col(j)|j#LE#Nstrat2: a(i,j)*Y(j)));
@SUM(col(j)|j#LE#Nstrat2: Y(j)) = 1;

endsubmodel
! ****;

CALC:
@SET('DEFAULT');
@SET('TERSEO', 2);

```

```

@for(ResGC: TransP = 0;
@for(res(xxx):
RESTOT = xxx-1;
@for(g(i)|i#LE#xxx:
GS1 = i-1;
@for(c(j):
CA2 = j-1;
Pdeath = 0;
@IFC(CA2#GE#1: Pdeath = 1 - 1/(1+CA2));
@for(res(n): prob(n) = 0);
@for(res2(n)|n#LE#xxx :
RESTOTnext = n;
REDUCT = RESTOTnext - RESTOT;
prob(n) = - (@PBN(Pdeath, GS1, - REDUCT)
- @PBN(Pdeath, GS1, -(REDUCT-1))) ;
TransP(xxx,n,i,j) = prob(n);
);
);
);
);

EXTRA = 100;

TMAX = 5;
TMAXP1 = TMAX+1;

@for(TXY(t,i,j)|t#EQ#TMAXP1: VALOPT(t,i,j) = 0);

t = TMAXP1;
@WHILE( t#GT#1:
t = t - 1;
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1),'t = ', @FORMAT(t, '2G'),@NEWLINE(1) );

GS1max = -1;
@while(GS1max#LT#3:
GS1max = GS1max+1;

GS2max = -1;
@while(GS2max#LT#3:
GS2max = GS2max+1;

Resource_1 = GS1max;
Resource_2 = GS2max;
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));
@WRITE('*****',@NEWLINE(1));
@WRITE('t = ',@FORMAT(t, '2G'), ' Resource_1 = ',
@FORMAT(Resource_1, '3G'), ' Resource_2 = ',
@FORMAT(Resource_2, '3G'),@NEWLINE(1) );

```

```

Nstrat1 = GS1max + 1;
Nstrat2 = GS2max + 1;

@for(rowcol(i,j)|i#LE#Nstrat1 #AND# j#LE#Nstrat2 :a(i,j) = 0);

@for(rowcol(i,j)|i#LE#Nstrat1 #AND# j#LE#Nstrat2 :
GS1 = i-1;
CA1 = GS1max - GS1;
GS2 = j-1;
CA2 = GS2max - GS2;

R = ( (GS1)/(1+CA2/4) - (GS2)/(1 + CA1/4) ) ;
disc = .9;

tnext = t+1;

a(i,j) = R + EXTRA;

restot1now = Nstrat1-1;
restot1nowcorr = restot1now+1;
GS1corr = GS1+1;
CA1corr = CA1+1;

restot2now = Nstrat2-1;
restot2nowcorr = restot2now+1;
GS2corr = GS2+1;
CA2corr = CA2+1;

summan = 0;
reslindex = 0;
@WHILE(reslindex#LT#4:
reslindex = reslindex+1;
res2index = 0;
@WHILE(res2index#LT#4:
res2index = res2index+1;
summan = summan +
TransP(restot1nowcorr,reslindex,GS1corr,CA2corr)
* TransP(restot2nowcorr,res2index,GS2corr, CA1corr)*
VALOPT(tnext,reslindex, res2index)
);
);
);

a(i,j) = a(i,j) + disc*summan;

);

@WRITE('Nstrat1 = ', @FORMAT(Nstrat1, '3.0G'), ' Nstrat2 = ',
@FORMAT(Nstrat2, '3.5G') );

@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));
@WRITE(Nstrat2*-----,@NEWLINE(1));
@for(row(i)|i#LE#Nstrat1:
@for(col(j)|j#LE#Nstrat2:
@WRITE( @Format(a(i,j)-EXTRA, '7.5G'), 5*' ');
);
@WRITE(@NEWLINE(1));
);
@WRITE(Nstrat2*-----,@NEWLINE(1));

```

```

@SOLVE(Dec1);
V(1) = V1;
@for(row(i):Xopt(i) = X(i));

@SOLVE(Dec2);
V(2) = V2;
@for(col(j):Yopt(j) = Y(j));

Value = V(1)-EXTRA;
DEV = V(1) - V(2);
VALOPT(t,1+Resource_1,1+Resource_2) = Value;

@ifc( @sqr(DEV) #gt# .1: @write(' *** OPTIMIZATION ERROR *** ');
@write('Value = ', @format(Value, '7.5G'));
@write(@newline(1));
@write('Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:',@newline(1) );
@for(row(i)|i #le# Nstrat1:
@write( @format(Xopt(i), '7.5G'), 5*' ');
);
@write(@newline(1));

@write('Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:',@newline(1) );
@for(col(j)|j #le# Nstrat2:
@write( @format(Yopt(j), '7.5G'), 5*' ');
);
@write(@newline(1));
@write(@newline(1));

);
);
);

@for(TXY(tt,xx,yy)|tt#le#5 #and# xx#le#4 #and# yy#le#4:
@write(@newline(1),'t = ', tt, ' x = ', xx, ' y = ', yy,
' VALOPT() = ',VALOPT(tt,xx,yy) ) );

ENDCALC

end

```

```

t = 5

*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
1

*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
0 -1
-----
Value = -1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0 1

*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
0 -1 -2
-----
Value = -2
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0 0 1

*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
0 -1 -2 -3
-----
Value = -3
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0 0 0 1

```

```
*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
0
1
-----
Value = 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
1

*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
0 -0.8
0.8 0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0 1

*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
0 -0.8 -1.6
0.66667 -0.2 -1
-----
Value = -1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0 0 1

*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
0 -0.8 -1.6 -2.4
0.57143 -0.33333 -1.2 -2
-----
Value = -2
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0 0 1
```

```
*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
0
1
2
-----
Value = 2
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0 0 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
1

*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
0 -0.66667
0.8 0.2
1.6 1
-----
Value = 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0 0 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0 1

*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
0 -0.66667 -1.3333
0.66667 0 -0.6
1.3333 0.6 0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0 0 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0 0 1

*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
0 -0.66667 -1.3333 -2
0.57143 -0.13333 -0.8 -1.4
1.1429 0.33333 -0.4 -1
-----
Value = -1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0 0 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0 0 0 1
```

```
*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
0
1
2
3
-----
Value = 3
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0 0 0 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
1

*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
0 -0.57143
0.8 0.33333
1.6 1.2
2.4 2
-----
Value = 2
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0 0 0 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0 1

*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
0 -0.57143 -1.1429
0.66667 0.13333 -0.33333
1.3333 0.8 0.4
2 1.4 1
-----
Value = 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0 0 0 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0 0 1
```

```
*****
t = 5 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
      0     -0.57143    -1.1429    -1.7143
0.57143          0     -0.53333        -1
1.1429     0.53333          0     -0.4
1.7143           1     0.4          0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      0         0         0         1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      0         0         0         1

t = 4
*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
      0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      1

*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
      -0.9     -1.9
-----
Value = -1.9
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      0         1

*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
      -1.8     -2.8     -3.8
-----
Value = -3.8
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      0         0         1
```

```
*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
-2.7      -3.7      -4.7      -5.7
-----
Value = -5.7
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 0      0      0      1

*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
0.9
1.9
-----
Value = 1.9
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 0      1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1

*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
0      -0.35
0.35      0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 0      1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 0      1

*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
-0.9      -1.25      -1.6
-0.83333      -1.55      -1.9
-----
Value = -1.6
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1      0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 0      0      1
```

```
*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
-1.8      -2.15      -2.5      -2.85
-1.9036    -2.7333    -3.45      -3.8
-----
Value = -2.85
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 0          0          0          1

*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
1.8
2.8
3.8
-----
Value = 3.8
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 0          0          1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1

*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
0.9      0.83333
1.25     1.55
1.6      1.9
-----
Value = 1.6
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 0          0          1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1          0

*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
0      -0.066667      -0.13333
0.066667      0          0.3
0.13333      -0.3        0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 0          1          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 0          1          0
```

```
*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
-0.9 -0.96667 -1.0333 -1.1
-1.0036 -1.1833 -1.25 -0.95
-1.1071 -1.7667 -2.2 -1.9
-----
Value = -1.0727
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0.81818 0.18182 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0 0 0.40909 0.59091

*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
2.7
3.7
4.7
5.7
-----
Value = 5.7
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0 0 0 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
1

*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
1.8 1.9036
2.15 2.7333
2.5 3.45
2.85 3.8
-----
Value = 2.85
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0 0 0 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
1 0
```

```
*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
0.9      1.0036      1.1071
0.96667   1.1833      1.7667
1.0333    1.25        2.2
1.1       0.95        1.9
-----
Value = 1.0727
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0          0        0.40909  0.59091
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0.81818   0.18182    0

*****
t = 4 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
0      0.10357     0.20714     0.31071
-0.10357    0        0.21667     0.8
-0.20714   -0.21667    0        0.95
-0.31071    -0.8      -0.95      0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
1          0        0        0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
1          0        0        0

t = 3
*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
1

*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
-1.71      -2.71
-----
Value = -2.71
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0          1
```

```
*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
-3.42      -4.42      -5.42
-----
Value = -5.42
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0      0      1

*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
-5.13      -6.13      -7.13      -8.13
-----
Value = -8.13
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
0      0      0      1

*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
1.71
2.71
-----
Value = 2.71
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
0      1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
1

*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
0      0.055
-0.055      0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
1      0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
1      0
```

```
*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
-1.44      -1.52      -1.5325
-2.0933    -2.63      -2.44
-----
Value = -1.5325
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 0          0          1

*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
-2.565     -2.8025    -2.9612    -3.0469
-3.9173    -4.6083    -5.0475    -4.565
-----
Value = -3.0469
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 0          0          0          1

*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
3.42
4.42
5.42
-----
Value = 5.42
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 0          0          1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1

*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
1.44      2.0933
1.52      2.63
1.5325    2.44
-----
Value = 1.5325
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 0          0          1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1          0
```

```
*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
      0      0.29333     0.82667
-0.29333      0      0.975
-0.82667    -0.975      0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      1      0      0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      1      0      0

*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
-0.96545    -0.98848    -0.80061    -0.38242
-1.5937     -1.6292     -1.4213     -0.55318
-2.765      -3.1939     -3.2064     -1.9655
-----
Value = -0.98848
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      1      0      0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      0      1      0      0

*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
      5.13
      6.13
      7.13
      8.13
-----
Value = 8.13
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      0      0      0      1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      1

*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
      2.565      3.9173
      2.8025     4.6083
      2.9612     5.0475
      3.0469     4.565
-----
Value = 3.0469
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      0      0      0      1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      1      0
```

```
*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
0.96545    1.5937    2.765
0.98848    1.6292    3.1939
0.80061    1.4213    3.2064
0.38242    0.55318   1.9655
-----
Value = 0.98848
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 0          1          0          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1          0          0          0

*****
t = 3 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
 0      0.15266    0.662     1.6678
-0.15266      0      0.51758    1.8745
 -0.662     -0.51758      0      1.5652
-1.6678     -1.8745    -1.5652      0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1          0          0          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1          0          0          0

t = 2
*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
 0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1

*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
 -2.439     -3.439
-----
Value = -3.439
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 0          1
```

```
*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
-4.878 -5.878 -6.878
-----
Value = -6.878
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 0      0      1

*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
-7.317 -8.317 -9.317 -10.317
-----
Value = -10.317
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 0      0      0      1

*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
2.439
3.439
-----
Value = 3.439
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 0      1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1

*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
 0      0.4195
-0.4195      0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1      0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1      0
```

```
*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
-1.3792    -1.4896    -1.3351
-3.0451    -3.3286    -2.3792
-----
Value = -1.4896
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
    1          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
    0          1          0

*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
-2.7422    -2.8607    -2.9752    -2.9551
-5.6019    -6.1254    -6.2296    -4.7422
-----
Value = -2.9752
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
    1          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
    0          0          1          0

*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
4.878
5.878
6.878
-----
Value = 6.878
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
    0          0          1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
    1

*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
1.3792    3.0451
1.4896    3.3286
1.3351    2.3792
-----
Value = 1.4896
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
    0          1          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
    1          0
```

```
*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
      0     0.25283     1.4477
-0.25283      0     1.3091
-1.4477    -1.3091      0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      1     0     0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      1     0     0

*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
-0.88964    -0.96321    -0.81918     0.025384
-1.7076     -1.6554     -1.4264     -0.38424
-4.0569     -4.2363     -3.8228     -1.8896
-----
Value = -0.96321
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      1     0     0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      0     1     0     0

*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
7.317
8.317
9.317
10.317
-----
Value = 10.317
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      0     0     0     1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      1

*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
2.7422     5.6019
2.8607     6.1254
2.9752     6.2296
2.9551     4.7422
-----
Value = 2.9752
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      0     0     1     0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      1     0
```

```
*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
0.88964    1.7076    4.0569
0.96321    1.6554    4.2363
0.81918    1.4264    3.8228
-0.025384   0.38424   1.8896
-----
Value = 0.96321
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 0          1          0          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1          0          0

*****
t = 2 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
 0    0.095799    0.73324    2.6545
-0.095799      0    0.53081    2.5844
-0.73324    -0.53081      0    1.8766
-2.6545    -2.5844    -1.8766      0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1          0          0          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1          0          0          0

t = 1
*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
 0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1

*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
-3.0951    -4.0951
-----
Value = -4.0951
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 0          1
```

```
*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
-6.1902 -7.1902 -8.1902
-----
Value = -8.1902
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 0      0      1

*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 0 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 1 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
-9.2853 -10.285 -11.285 -12.285
-----
Value = -12.285
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 0      0      0      1

*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
3.0951
4.0951
-----
Value = 4.0951
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 0      1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1

*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
 0      0.74755
-0.74755      0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
 1      0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
 1      0
```

```
*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
-1.3407 -1.4703 -1.1614
-3.907 -3.9654 -2.3407
-----
Value = -1.4703
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
    1          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
    0          1          0

*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 1 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 2 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
-2.6777 -2.8092 -2.9397 -2.8506
-7.062 -7.4161 -7.1815 -4.6777
-----
Value = -2.9397
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
    1          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
    0          0          1          0

*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
6.1902
7.1902
8.1902
-----
Value = 8.1902
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
    0          0          1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
    1

*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
1.3407      3.907
1.4703      3.9654
1.1614      2.3407
-----
Value = 1.4703
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
    0          1          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
    1          0
```

```
*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
      0      0.22711      2.0137
-0.22711      0      1.6179
-2.0137     -1.6179      0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      1      0      0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      1      0      0

*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 2 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 3 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
-0.86689     -0.95563     -0.8338      0.39788
-1.6535      -1.6173     -1.4107     -0.23184
-5.1384      -5.0799     -4.2769     -1.8669
-----
Value = -0.95563
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      1      0      0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      0      1      0      0

*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 0
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 1
-----
9.2853
10.285
11.285
12.285
-----
Value = 12.285
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      0      0      0      1
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      1

*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 1
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 2
-----
2.6777      7.062
2.8092      7.4161
2.9397      7.1815
2.8506      4.6777
-----
Value = 2.9397
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      0      0      1      0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      1      0
```

```
*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 2
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 3
-----
0.86689    1.6535    5.1384
0.95563    1.6173    5.0799
0.8338     1.4107    4.2769
-0.39788   0.23184   1.8669
-----
Value = 0.95563
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      0          1          0          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      1          0          0
*****
```



```
*****
t = 1 Resource_1 = 3 Resource_2 = 3
Nstrat1 = 4 Nstrat2 = 4
-----
      0      0.07874    0.68841    3.4545
-0.07874      0      0.50411    3.1339
-0.68841     -0.50411      0      2.0899
-3.4545      -3.1339    -2.0899      0
-----
Value = 0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 1:
      1          0          0          0
Optimal Decision Frequencies of Player 2:
      1          0          0          0
```



```
t = 1 x = 1 y = 1 VALOPT() = 0
t = 1 x = 1 y = 2 VALOPT() = -4.095100000000002
t = 1 x = 1 y = 3 VALOPT() = -8.19020000000004
t = 1 x = 1 y = 4 VALOPT() = -12.28529999999999
t = 1 x = 2 y = 1 VALOPT() = 4.09510000000002
t = 1 x = 2 y = 2 VALOPT() = 0
t = 1 x = 2 y = 3 VALOPT() = -1.470331249999987
t = 1 x = 2 y = 4 VALOPT() = -2.93974492187499
t = 1 x = 3 y = 1 VALOPT() = 8.19020000000004
t = 1 x = 3 y = 2 VALOPT() = 1.470331249999987
t = 1 x = 3 y = 3 VALOPT() = 0
t = 1 x = 3 y = 4 VALOPT() = -0.9556303030303042
t = 1 x = 4 y = 1 VALOPT() = 12.28529999999999
t = 1 x = 4 y = 2 VALOPT() = 2.93974492187499
t = 1 x = 4 y = 3 VALOPT() = 0.9556303030303042
t = 1 x = 4 y = 4 VALOPT() = 0
t = 2 x = 1 y = 1 VALOPT() = 0
t = 2 x = 1 y = 2 VALOPT() = -3.439000000000007
t = 2 x = 1 y = 3 VALOPT() = -6.878
t = 2 x = 1 y = 4 VALOPT() = -10.31699999999999
t = 2 x = 2 y = 1 VALOPT() = 3.439000000000007
t = 2 x = 2 y = 2 VALOPT() = 0
t = 2 x = 2 y = 3 VALOPT() = -1.48962499999999
t = 2 x = 2 y = 4 VALOPT() = -2.975171875000001
t = 2 x = 3 y = 1 VALOPT() = 6.878
t = 2 x = 3 y = 2 VALOPT() = 1.48962499999999
t = 2 x = 3 y = 3 VALOPT() = 0
t = 2 x = 3 y = 4 VALOPT() = -0.9632121212121234
```

```

t = 2 x = 4 y = 1 VALOPT() = 10.31699999999999
t = 2 x = 4 y = 2 VALOPT() = 2.97517187500001
t = 2 x = 4 y = 3 VALOPT() = 0.9632121212121234
t = 2 x = 4 y = 4 VALOPT() = 0
t = 3 x = 1 y = 1 VALOPT() = 0
t = 3 x = 1 y = 2 VALOPT() = -2.710000000000008
t = 3 x = 1 y = 3 VALOPT() = -5.420000000000002
t = 3 x = 1 y = 4 VALOPT() = -8.129999999999996
t = 3 x = 2 y = 1 VALOPT() = 2.710000000000008
t = 3 x = 2 y = 2 VALOPT() = 0
t = 3 x = 2 y = 3 VALOPT() = -1.532499999999999
t = 3 x = 2 y = 4 VALOPT() = -3.046875
t = 3 x = 3 y = 1 VALOPT() = 5.420000000000002
t = 3 x = 3 y = 2 VALOPT() = 1.532499999999999
t = 3 x = 3 y = 3 VALOPT() = 0
t = 3 x = 3 y = 4 VALOPT() = -0.9884848484848448
t = 3 x = 4 y = 1 VALOPT() = 8.129999999999996
t = 3 x = 4 y = 2 VALOPT() = 3.046875
t = 3 x = 4 y = 3 VALOPT() = 0.988484848484859
t = 3 x = 4 y = 4 VALOPT() = 0
t = 4 x = 1 y = 1 VALOPT() = 0
t = 4 x = 1 y = 2 VALOPT() = -1.900000000000006
t = 4 x = 1 y = 3 VALOPT() = -3.799999999999997
t = 4 x = 1 y = 4 VALOPT() = -5.700000000000003
t = 4 x = 2 y = 1 VALOPT() = 1.900000000000006
t = 4 x = 2 y = 2 VALOPT() = 0
t = 4 x = 2 y = 3 VALOPT() = -1.599999999999994
t = 4 x = 2 y = 4 VALOPT() = -2.850000000000009
t = 4 x = 3 y = 1 VALOPT() = 3.799999999999997
t = 4 x = 3 y = 2 VALOPT() = 1.599999999999994
t = 4 x = 3 y = 3 VALOPT() = 0
t = 4 x = 3 y = 4 VALOPT() = -1.072727272727263
t = 4 x = 4 y = 1 VALOPT() = 5.700000000000003
t = 4 x = 4 y = 2 VALOPT() = 2.850000000000009
t = 4 x = 4 y = 3 VALOPT() = 1.072727272727278
t = 4 x = 4 y = 4 VALOPT() = 0
t = 5 x = 1 y = 1 VALOPT() = 0
t = 5 x = 1 y = 2 VALOPT() = -1
t = 5 x = 1 y = 3 VALOPT() = -2
t = 5 x = 1 y = 4 VALOPT() = -3
t = 5 x = 2 y = 1 VALOPT() = 1
t = 5 x = 2 y = 2 VALOPT() = 0
t = 5 x = 2 y = 3 VALOPT() = -1
t = 5 x = 2 y = 4 VALOPT() = -2
t = 5 x = 3 y = 1 VALOPT() = 2
t = 5 x = 3 y = 2 VALOPT() = 1
t = 5 x = 3 y = 3 VALOPT() = 0
t = 5 x = 3 y = 4 VALOPT() = -1
t = 5 x = 4 y = 1 VALOPT() = 3
t = 5 x = 4 y = 2 VALOPT() = 2
t = 5 x = 4 y = 3 VALOPT() = 1
t = 5 x = 4 y = 4 VALOPT() = 0

```